

**GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT
DEPARTMENT OF SCHOOL EDUCATION AND LITERACY
MID DAY MEAL DIVISION**

**Minutes of the Meeting of the Programme Approval Board for
Mid-Day Meal**

26.02.09

1. A meeting of the Programme Approval Board for Mid-Day Meal was held at New Delhi on 26.02.09 under the Chairpersonship of Smt. Anshu Vaish, Secretary, Department of School Education and Literacy (SE&L), Government of India. The agenda before the PAB was to (a) review the status and progress of the implementation of the Mid Day Meal (MDM) Programme for the States of **Karnataka and Tamil Nadu** (b) consider their proposals for the MDM Scheme - Annual Work Plan and Budget (AWP&B) 2009-10. A list of members who participated in the meeting is attached at ***Annexure-I***.

2. Shri Anant Kumar Singh, Joint Secretary (EE-I) [JS(EE-I)], Department of School Education and Literacy, Govt. of India welcomed the chairperson, members of MDM-PAB and other participants from the States. The meeting began with a quick round of self-introductions, following which JS(EE-I) requested the representative of the State Governments to highlight the progress achieved during 2008-09, best practices followed in the States and proposals for 2009-10.

With these initial interventions, Smt. Anshu Vaish, Secretary, SE&L invited the State representatives to make their presentations on the AWP&B for 2009-10.

3. KARNATAKA:

3.1 After the introductory remarks by Shri. RG Nandadur, Principal Secretary ((Primary & Secondary Education), Govt. of Karnataka, Shri Kumar Naik, Commissioner, Public Instruction, Govt. of Karnataka made a power point presentation on the State's Annual Work Plan & Budget, 2009-10. The salient features of the presentation were as follows:-

- (i) The Mid Day Meal Programme, popularly known as Akshara Dasoha Programme in the State is being implemented by providing hot and hygienic cooked meal to all children studying in classes I to 10 in the Government & Aided Primary and High Schools.
- (ii) The total schools covered under the scheme at Primary stage are 47924 and 7383 at High Schools. The number of children benefited upto 31.12.2009 is 36.10 lakhs at Primary stage and 20.73 at Upper Primary stage.

- (iii) In case of Primary School every meal contains 490 Calories and 12 gms of Protein. In case of High School every meal contains 700 Calories and 18 gms of Protein. The quantity of foodgrains in grams is as under:-

Items	Primary 1 - 5	Upper Primary 6-8	High Schools 9-10
Rice	100	150	150
Pulses	20	25	25
Vegetables	50	70	70
Salt	02	04	04
Oil	03	06	06

- (iv) The additional nutrition provided to children is as under:-

Vitamin A	2 lakh IU	2 tablets/year
Iron & Folic acid tablets	20 mg	108 tablets/year (alternate days for 36 weeks)
Albendazole tablets (Deworming tablets)	400 mg	2 tablets/ year
Total cost Rs. 14/child/year		

- (v) For supervision and effective monitoring of Mid Day Meal Scheme in the State, the following arrangements have been made:-

- (a) Steering cum Monitoring committee has been setup at State, Dist and Taluk level
- (b) District level Committee - Chairmanship of District-in-charge Minister, Elected Representatives and Officials of Departments.
- (c) Education officer at District level & Asst director at Taluk to coordinate & supervise.
- (d) Doctors and PHC staff to inspect & monitor Cleanliness & Hygiene.
- (e) Training programme to the School Committee Members, Head Teachers and Cooks.

- (vi) All the cooks are women in the Kitchen centers. There are reservation for SC/ST, OBC and other categories. Priority is given to Widow, Destitute, economically weaker sections, Stree Shakti and women SHGs. Cooks are appointed by four member committee as under:-

President- Chairman of Gram Panchayath
 Member- SDMC president
 Member- Head master of the school.
 Member Secretary- Secretary, Gram Panchayath.

Rs. 800, Rs. 550, Rs. 500 and Rs. 400/- is paid to Head Cook, Cook, Asst. Cook and Helper respectively in primary schools. Rs. 800, Rs. 550, is paid to Head Cook and Cooks respectively in High schools.

- (vii) In Karnataka, 106 NGOs participate in the programme covering 10,98,076 children of 4560 schools. Major NGOs are Akshaya Pathra, J.S.S, Adama Chethana, Krishna Math and others. NGOs are provided 100gms rice and conversion cost of Rs 1.80/child/day for Class 1 to 5 children. NGOs are provided 150gms rice and conversion cost of Rs 2.20/child/day for Class 6 to 10 children. Transportation charges @ Rs 75/quintal.
- (viii) The good practices followed by the State for implementation of the programme are as under:-
 - (a) One cook in every kitchen center from SC/ST.
 - (b) Women as cooks - preference given to widows, destitute women
 - (c) LPG for cooking.
 - (d) Mothers committee constituted to ensure cleanliness and serving food to children.
 - (e) Kitchen Gardens maintained & wall writings on kitchen wall displaying quantity, cleanliness & food grains statistics.
 - (f) Teachers taste food before serving to children.
- (ix) In this financial year 2008-09 Price Water House Coopers has been entrusted the work of Evaluation of Mid Day Meal Scheme. Report is expected to be submitted by the end of May 2009.
- (x) Suvarna Arogya Chaitanya Programme is conducted in collaboration with Health Dept. In the financial year 2008-09 health checkup programme was conducted from 18-08-08 to 12-09-08. Out of 91.76 lakh children, 84.00 lakh have undergone health check up. Rs 12.55 lakhs and Rs 18.93 lakhs spent towards printing 51 Lakh health cards from SSA and NRHM funds respectively. 96.10 lakhs provided towards fuel charges @ Rs 50,000/taluk from MDM funds. Rs 740.79 Lakhs spent towards heart operation and cochlear implant for 1621 children under NRHM.

3.2 Govt. of Karnataka made the following request for the consideration of Govt. of India:-

- i) Quantity of rice (raw) of 150 gms. for upper primary is slightly in excess of what a child of 10-14 years could consume in a meal. Central govt. may reexamine the quantity of food grains allocation for upper primary.
- ii) Central Assistance towards transportation assistance at the rate of Rs. 75 per quintal and constructions of kitchen sheds @ Rs. 60,000 per units are much less than the actual requirement/expenditure in the field level. Central govt. may enhance the central assistance under these heads which would improve the quality of implementation of the Scheme.

3.3 In response, JS (EE-I) informed that Central govt. is in the process of instituting a study for reexamination of foodgrains allocation for both primary and upper primary in view of the ability of children in the age group of 6-13 years to consume in one meal. State Govt. may also institute a study with reputed institution in Karnataka to scientifically work out the actual requirement of food grains to meet the overall nutrition norms prescribed under MDM Scheme. Further, he requested the State Govt. to work out the quantum of enhancement under the transportation and construction of kitchen sheds on rational basis and send the same along with justification thereon to the central Govt. for consideration. At the same time, State Govt. should also proactively pursue convergence with other developmental programme to mobilize additional resources for implementation of MDM Scheme.

3.4 Karnataka is one of the States wherein large scale NGOs are participating in the programme by supplying meals cooked through centralized kitchens. Chairperson, Secretary (SE&L) requested the State Govt. to address the following issues while engaging the NGOs under MDM Scheme:-

- (i) Community mobilization is one of the critical areas in the implementation of the programme. Community participation will ensure effective monitoring at the field level and also facilitate a sense of ownership of the programme in the community. The arrangement such as meal cooked, preferably, by women from the disadvantaged section of the society being eaten by children from all sections of society would act as solvent to social prejudices and barriers and promote social equity.
- (ii) It is observed that the NGOs engaged under MDM Scheme in their mass media campaigns generally leaves out the role of Governments who make substantial contributions i.e. 70-80% of the cost of meal. Nobody should be allowed to draw undue mileage under the Scheme. Public perception should not be misled through skewed media campaign. Role of Governments along with MDM logo should be prominently displayed.

3.5 Dr. Kiran Devendra, NCERT invited attention of participants to the general perception that MDM Scheme increases work load of teachers and thereby affects the teaching-learning process inside the class rooms. She requested the State Governments to clearly demarcate the roles of teachers and cooks/helpers and also sensitize them through training programmes. Mass media campaign also can dispel such notion.

3.6 To query raised by JS (EE-I) regarding payments of cooking cost to the cooking agencies, the State Govt. representative stated that Rs. 1.80 per child per day for primary stage is paid out to Schools as well as NGOs since the balance amount of Rs. 0.77 (Rs. 2.57 – Rs.1.80) is retained by the State Govt. for expenses related to Administrative costs and cooks salary etc., JS(EE-I) pointed out that as no administrative cost for preparing the food is being borne by the State Govt., there is no justification for deducting any amount on this account. Cost of management and monitoring has to come from MME head. In view of this, he requested the State Govt. to re-examine this issue and take necessary corrective measures.

3.7 Dr. C.G. Venkatesha Murthy, representative of Regional Institute of Education, Mysore (RIE, Mysore), the Monitoring Institute for Karnataka has informed that the Institution has conducted the survey of implementation of the scheme in Hassan, Davangere, Raichur and Bidar Districts for the period 1st October, 2007 to 31st March, 2008 and following problems are found in the implementation of the scheme in these districts:-

- (i) Store Rooms in most of the schools were inadequate.
- (ii) Pucca Kitchen was found in only 30% schools.
- (iii) The monitoring of implementation of the scheme was very poor.
- (iv) Adequate cooking vessels were not provided in most of the schools

In response, the State Govt. representative has assured the Board that these issues will be suitable addressed in due course and necessary corrective measures will be under taken at the earliest.

3.8 Shri K. Ravi Ramachandran, Director (MDM), Govt. of India made an analysis of the State's performance in the implementation of the MDM Scheme for the period 1.4.08 to 31.12.08 (Primary + Upper Primary) and the Appraisal Note enclosing the Analysis Sheet was provided to the State Representative for reference. The presentation highlighted the following important issues:

3.8.1 Level of Opening balance as on 01.04.08 and 31.12.08:

An analysis of the district wise unspent balance of food grains as on 31.03.08 shows that 3 out of 29 districts had NIL balance and 12 districts had less than 5%. Raichur District has 39% of allocation as unspent balance. Details of district wise unspent balance position is given in *Table 1.2.1 of the Analysis Sheet.*

An analysis of district wise unspent balance of food grains as on 31.12.08 shows negative unspent balance for Chikkaballapur (-33%) and Ramanagar (-13%) Dists. Details of district wise unspent balance position is given in *Table 1.2.2 of the Analysis Sheet.*

The State Govt. is requested to analyze and report the reasons for Negative and NIL balance as on 31.03.08 and on 31.12.08 as reported by the State Govt. It is also to be confirmed that the State Govt. did not treat release of resources from one level to another level e.g. from State to District, District to Block and downwards as utilization.

3.8.2 Lifting of foodgrains:

Considering that three-fourth of the year was over by 31.12.2008, the districts should have lifted **at least 85%** of the food grains allocation. State level total lifting (availability) as on 31.12.08 was 78%. The district-wise lifting was as under:-

Total No. of Districts = 29 (*Refer Table 1.5 of the Analysis Sheet*).

Sl. No.	Level of lifting	No. of Districts	Name of the districts
1	Below 75%	11	Ramanagar (39%, Chikkaballapur (41%), Bangalore-U (66%) etc.
2	75% to 95%	17	
3	Above 95%	1	Bangalore-R (96%)

3.8.3 Utilization of food grains:

Considering that three-fourths of the year was over by 31.12.2008, the districts should have utilized **at least 70%** of the foodgrains allocation. **State level utilization was 67%**. Inter-district variation in utilization was as under: -

Total No. of Districts = 29(*Refer Table 1.7 of the Analysis Sheet*).

Sl. No.	Level of utilization	No. of Districts	Name of the districts
1	Below 65%	9	Ramanagar (52%), Haveri (54%), Dharwad (56%), Mangalore-DK (58%)
2	65% to 85	20	
3	Above 85%	0	

3.8.4 Utilization of cooking cost:

State level utilization is 73%. Inter-district variation in utilization was as under:-

Total No. of Districts = 29 (Refer Table 2.7 of the Analysis Sheet).

Sl. No	Level of utilization	No. of Districts	Number of Districts
1	Below 70%	4	Charmajnagar (60%), Bangalore-(65%) Bidar (66%) etc.
2	70% - 80%	24	
3	Above 80%	1	Chikkaballpur (81%)

3.8.5 Matching of utilization of foodgrains and cooking cost:

Ideally the percentage utilization of cooking costs and foodgrains should tally with each other. At the state level the utilization of cooking cost is 6% more than the foodgrains, but in the following districts this gap is much wider, which needs deeper analysis by the State:

Total No. of Districts = 29 (Refer Table 3.1 of the Analysis Sheet).

Sr. No.	District	% utilization of foodgrains	% utilization of Cooking cost	Mis-match in % points
1	<u>Excess Cooking cost utilization</u> Haveri	54%	79%	24 pp
2	Ramanagara	52%	72%	20 pp
4	Mangalore-DK	58%	75%	17 pp
5	Dharwad	56%	71%	15 pp

3.8.6 Reconciliation of utilization of foodgrains vis-à-vis no. of meals served:

Utilisation of foodgrains as against the no. of meals served, shows wide variations in the following districts:-

Total No. of Districts = 29 (Refer Table 3.3 of the Analysis Sheet).

No.	District	No. of Meals served	Expected consumption of food grains (MTs)	Actual Consumption of food grains (MTs)	Diff in percentage*
1	Chikkaballapur	1,88,65,245	2343.42	1068.31	- 54%
2	Ramnagar	1,71,48,105	1930.10	882.01	- 54%
3	Haveri	2,98,89,098	3632.51	2475.53	- 32%
4	Mangalore-DK	3,39,37,676	4012.06	3055.17	- 24%
5	Dharwad	2,94,39,886	3240.74	2508.59	- 23%
6	Kolar	2,46,28,518	2868.87	3384.83	+ 18%
7	Bangalore-R	1,40,84,162	1609.54	2175.41	+ 35%

* '- 'deficit / '+' excess consumption.

3.8.7 A sum of **Rs. 553.40 lakhs** was released during 2008-09 (including unspent balance as on 31.3.08) as Central Assistance towards MME. Against this, the State has shown utilisation of Rs. 415.04 lakh (75%).

3.8.8 A sum of **Rs. 1085.28 lakhs** was released during 2008-09 (including unspent balance as on 31.3.08) as Central Assistance towards Transport Assistance. Against this, the State has shown utilization of Rs. 751.19 lakh (69%).

3.8.9 Out of **Rs. 167.08 Crore** of Central assistance released towards construction of 27847 kitchen sheds during 2006-07 and 2007-08 for primary and upper primary stage, the State reported **only 31% progress as on 31.12.2008.**

3.8.10 Out of **Rs. 15.80 crore** of Central assistance released towards procurement of kitchen devices for 31,591 schools during 2006-07 and 2007-08 for primary and upper primary stage, the State reported 100% physical and financial progress.

3.8.11 State Govt. was requested to critically review the position in the light of above analysis/observations and to take corrective steps on immediately wherever large scale discrepancies exist. These aspects should be critically monitored on quarterly basis by the supervisory officers at the District and State level. State Govt. was also requested to send an Action Taken Report to the Govt. of India at the earliest.

State representative undertook to look into the matter and assured that necessary remedial actions will be taken under intimation of Govt. of India.

3.9 State Government in the AWP&B, 2009-10 has proposed to cover 36,09,920 children at primary stage as against the last year PAB approval of 37,79,066 children. Secretary (SE&L) expressed concern over above mentioned decrease in number of children availing mid day meal. JS(EE.I) informed the Board that in the Quarterly Progress Report for the first two quarters, State Government has shown same number of children covered under the scheme as 36,27,598. This is quite unlikely that same number of children took mid day meal in both quarters. The number of children as proposed by State Government in AWP&B is less than the number of children shown in the QPRs. It shows that either the number of children shown in the QPRs may not be fully correct or number of children proposed for 2009-10 are not well founded. JS(EE.I) requested the State Government to examine this issue in depth and give a realistic number of children, who are likely to be covered under the scheme. State Government representatives were also requested to clarify the reasons for not including 35,000 students studying in AIE Centres in the AWP&B 2009-10.

3.10 In the financial year 2006-07 and 2007-08 respectively, 244 and 236 working days were sanctioned for this scheme but as per DISE data there were only 212 and 216 working days respectively in these two years. Therefore, the request of the State Govt. for 247 days could not be acceded to. Instead, 216 working days are being approved with the clarification that this quantification is only an estimate for release of Central Assistance during 2009-10 under MDM Scheme. This scheme clearly provides that every student attending the Institutions, eligible to be covered under the Scheme will be served mid day meal on all school days. Therefore, the State will provide meal to all such students irrespective of the approved numbers of students and working days.. In the event of State govt. finding on the basis of (i) MDM Attendance Registers maintained at School level and (ii) QPRs that the average number of children availing mid day meal (actual) and the working days are going to be more than the above approved figures, it may approach the GOI with evidence for enhancement of Central Assistance immediately after the end of first quarter (i.e. 30.6.2009). D/o School Education & Literacy with the approval of the Secretary, SE&L, Government of India will take a decision in this regard and put up the matter for post facto approval to the MDM-PAB.

3.10 Govt. of Karnataka vide its letter dated 18.3.09 has now clarified that:

- i) The State Govt. is examining the QPRs and the reply will be sent in due course. However, there will be no much variation in number of children availing MDM between the two quarters.
- ii) Total number of children in classes 6 to 8 expected to consume MDM shown to be **20.73 lakhs**. This works out 89% of 23.31 lakhs which is the total enrolment in classes 6 to 8 in Karnataka. The DISE data shows the enrolment figures as 17.84 lakhs. This does not include the 5.47 lakhs of children in 8th Standard.
- iii) Revised strength of children of classes 1 to 5 inclusive of children studying in AIE Centres is given in the prescribed Performa. 16,117 children who are likely to avail MDM in AIE Centres are included. State Government has therefore requested to allocate the Central assistance based on **36,26,037** children.(Primary).
- iv) With regard to quantity of foodgrains to be consumed by children in Karnataka, the matter for consumption of quantity of foodgrains by 6 to 14 years of age group children in a single meal is being examined. State Government has therefore requested that pending such examination and decision taken thereon, foodgrains may be allocated as per the existing norms as in the case of other States.

3.11 In view of the above, the MDM-PAB approved the following number of children (both Primary and Upper Primary) and number of school days for quantifying the Central assistance for **Karnataka** for Mid Day Meal for 2008-09 at the existing norms:-

Sl. No	Details	As per State Plan		Approval by MDM-PAB
		No. of Schools (Table No.3/3-A)	No. of Children (Table No.16/16-A)	
Primary				
1.1	Govt. + Govt. aided + LB schools	47,945	36,09,920	36,09,920
1.2	EGS	0	0	0
1.3	AIE	448	16,117	16,117
TOTAL (A)		48,393	36,26,037	36,26,037
Upper Primary				
1.4	Govt. + Govt. aided + LB schools	24,510	20,73,136	20,73,136
1.5	EGS	0	0	0
1.6	AIE	0	0	0
TOTAL (B)		24,510	20,73,136	20,73,136
GRAND TOTAL (A) +(B)		72,903	56,99,173	56,99,173
2	No. of Working days			
2.1	Primary		247	216
2.2	Upper Primary		247	216

The working of Central assistance for the Karnataka for 2009-10 based on the above mentioned number of children and Number of working days as approved by the MDM-PAB is enclosed as Annexure-2.

4. Tamil Nadu

4.1 Shri. Manivasan, Commissioner, Noon Meal Programme, Govt. of Tamil Nadu made a power point presentation on the State's Annual Work Plan & Budget, 2009-10. The salient features of the presentation were as follows:-

- (i) Started in 1982, at present the Scheme covers 28,974 schools at Primary stage. Similarly, at Upper Primary stage, all 12,249 schools are covered under the Scheme. The number of children benefited upto 31.12.2009 is 31.61 lakhs at Primary stage and 18.61 at Upper Primary stage.
- (ii) In addition to rice supplied by the Central Govt., the State Govt., through its own resources, supplies eggs (3 eggs/week/child), dhal, oil, double fortified salt, green gram, black gram, Bengal gram are supplied through Tamil Nadu Civil Supplies Corporation. Total unit cost of meal (excluding cost of foodgrains) is Rs. 3.77 per child per day for both primary as well as upper primary stage.
- (iii) The pay structure for the staff engaged in the implementation of Mid Day Meal Programme in the state is as under:-

Each Noon Meal center is provided with a Noon Meal Organizer, Cook and Assistant cook. One additional cook and helper is provided where the feeding strength exceeds 500.

(a) **Regular remuneration:**

<u>No. of Mid Day Meal Staff</u>	<u>Scale of Pay</u> (per month)	<u>Average salary</u>
N.M.O. = 41209	1300-20-1500-25-2500 (Non Standardized time scale)\	Rs. 3164
Cook = 41424	660-15-810-20-1010 (Special Time Scale)	Rs.1525
Asst. = 41127	500-10-600-20-800	Rs.1158
Total	<u>123760</u>	

(b) **Retirement Benefits**

	<u>Lump sum</u>	<u>Spl. P.F. cum G.S.</u>	<u>Special Pension</u>
N.M.O.	Rs.50,000	Rs.10,000	Rs. 700
Cook	Rs.20,000	Rs.10,000	Rs. 600
Cook Asst.	Rs.20,000	Rs.10,000	Rs. 500

- (iii) The monitoring of the scheme is done by State level Steering cum monitoring committee, District level, Block and village level committee. The field inspections are regularly done in the state.

- (iv) Extensive training programmes were conducted for the N.M.Os, Cooks and Assistants by engaging the services of Confederation of Indian Industries (CII) and a comprehensive Resource material in this regard has been developed to be supplied to each centre.
- (v) Development of e-MIS (Management Information System) is under progress.
- (vi) Avinasilingam University for Women, Coimbatore evaluated the programme in 2008. The salient features of the Evaluation Report are
 - (a) Study covered 180 centres, 38970 beneficiaries, 13772 non-beneficiaries, 1080 parents and 100 officials by 158 trained investigators
 - (b) 80% of rural & urban centres had proper roofing
 - (c) Majority of the centres had proper cement flooring
 - (d) Only 50% of rural and urban centres had good lighting & air circulation in the kitchen
 - (e) In more than 70% of the centres washing of vegetables, rice & dhall was done before cutting / cooking
 - (f) Participation and help rendered by VEC members and the community in the SMP was very weak
 - (g) Percentage of attendance was more or less similar between the days of egg feeding and without egg feeding (92.3 & 91.0%)
 - (h) Greater mean heights and weights of beneficiaries than non-beneficiaries though the difference is very meager
 - (i) Urban children have better growth records than their counterparts in rural and town panchayat areas
 - (j) Mean percentage of marks obtained by the beneficiary and non-beneficiary boys was 51.1 & 49.5 respectively and in girls 54.2 & 54.3.
 - (k) Beneficiary boys and girls recorded higher percentage of attendance (85.9 & 86.6) than non-beneficiary (84.4 & 83.5)

The recommendations of the Avinasilingam University for Women, Coimbatore are as under:-

- (a) Efforts are needed to improve the infrastructure
- (b) The funds allotted for fuel and vegetables need to be increased
- (c) Evaluation should be inbuilt in the programme
- (d) Refresher training programme must be organized to all nutritious meal organizers on proper cooking methods and maintenance of hygiene and basics of good nutrition
- (e) Possibilities of tapping solar energy for water heating and use of hot water for cooking and drinking needs to be explored
- (f) Need to explore the possibilities of using the precooked fortified rice as a measure to save fuel and labour and at the same time make the meal more nutritious

4.2 Commissioner, Mid Day Meal Scheme, Govt. of Tamil Nadu informed that in the State, the programme is being implemented upto class X and only 120 gms. of foodgrains per child per day is being given for Classes VI to X under State norms. But, as per the guidelines of the Central Govt. 150 gms of rice per child per day is provided. Thus, it creates anomaly that for the children in classes VI to VIII, the food grain allocation is 150 gms per day whereas for classes IX to X classes, the food grain allocation is 120 gms only. Hence, he requested the Central Govt. to re-examine the allocation of food grains under the Scheme.

In response, JS (EE-I) informed that Central govt. is in the process of instituting a study for reexamination of foodgrains allocation for both primary and upper primary in view of the ability of children in the age group of 6-13 years to consume in one meal. State Govt. may also institute a study with reputed institution in Tamilnadu to scientifically work out the actual requirement of food grains to meet the overall nutrition norms prescribed under MDM Scheme.

After the presentation, Chairperson, Secretary (SE&L) invited PAB members to make their comments.

4.3 JS (EE.I) informed the Board that Quarterly Progress Report for 2nd and 3rd Quarter of 2008-09 has not been received in the Ministry. Further, the QPR received for the Ist Quarter is for Primary Classes only. He enquired from state representative to indicate the reason for not sending the QPRs in time as regular and intense monitoring is key to successful implementation of a programme such as Mid Day Meal and QPRs are a crucial tool for this purpose. He requested the State Representative to take necessary action to send all the pending QPRs immediately.

4.4 Shri K. Ravi Ramachandran, Director (MDM), Govt. of India made an analysis of the State's performance in the implementation of the MDM Scheme for the period 1.4.08 to 31.12.08 (Primary + Upper Primary) and the Appraisal Note enclosing the Analysis Sheet was provided to the State Representative for reference. The presentation highlighted the following important issues:

4.4.1 Level of Opening balance as on 01.04.08 and 31.12.08:

An analysis of unspent balance of food grains as on 31.03.08, it was observed that 12 out of total 31 districts had NIL unspent balance and 14 districts had less than 5% unspent balance. The unspent balance as on 31.12.08 is negative (-11%) for Tiruvallur and (-8%) for Tuticorin and (-2%) for Namakkal Distt.

The State Govt. is requested to analyze and report the reasons for the Negative and NIL unutilized balance as on 31.03.08 and on 31.12.08 as reported by the State Govt. It is also to be confirmed that the State Govt. did not treat release of resources from one level to another level e.g. from State to District, District to Block and downwards as utilization.

4.4.2 Lifting of food grains:

Considering that three-fourths of the year over by 31.12.2008, the districts should have lifted **at least 85%** of the food grains allocation. **State level total lifting (availability) as on 31.12.08 was 64%**. The district wise lifting as on 31.12.08 is as under:-

Total No. of Districts = 31 (*Refer Table 1.5 of the Analysis Sheet*).

Sl. No.	Level of lifting	No. of Districts	Name of the districts
1	Below 75%	22	Cuddalore (37%), Madurai (43%), Ramanad (46%) etc.
2	75% to 95%	7	
3	Above 95%	2	Dharmapuri (104%) and Tiruvannamalai (96%)

4.4.3 Utilization of food grains:

Considering that three-fourths of the year was over by 31.12.2008, the districts should have utilized **at least 72%** of the foodgrains allocation. **State level utilization was 59%** Inter-district variation in utilization is as under: -

Total No. of Districts = 31 (Refer Table 1.6 of the Analysis Sheet).

Sl. No.	Level of utilisation	No. of Districts	Name of the districts
1	Below 65%	20	Cuddalore (34%), Madurai (39%), Ramanad (40%) , Theni (44%) etc.
2	65% to 85%	8	
3	Above 85%	3	Dharmapuri (98%), Pudukottai (94%) etc

4.4.4 Utilization of Cooking cost:

State level utilization is 64%. Inter-district variations in utilization was summarized as under:-

Total No. of Districts = 31 (Refer Table 2.7 of the Analysis Sheet).

Sl. No.	Level of utilisation	No. of Districts	Number of Districts
1	Below 70%	20	Chennai (45%), Ramanad (46%), Madurai (46%), Sivaganga (47%) etc
2	70% - 80%	9	
3	Above 80%	2	Pudukottai (111%) and Tiruvallur (81%)

4.4.5 Mismatch in utilization of food grains and cooking cost:

Ideally the percentage utilization of cooking costs and foodgrains should tally with each other. At the State level, utilization of cooking cost is 8% more than the foodgrains but the following districts, this gap is much wide which need deeper analysis by the State:-

	<u>Food grains</u>	<u>Cooking cost</u>
Primary+ Upper Primary (against 70%)	59%	64%

Total No. of Districts = 31 (Refer Table 3.1 of the Analysis Sheet).

Sr. No.	District	% utilisation of foodgrains	% utilisation of Cooking cost	Mis-match in % points
<u>Excess foodgrains utilization</u>				
1	Dharmapuri	98%	74%	24
2	Sivaganga	63%	47%	16
3	Tiruvannamalai	89%	74%	15
4	Coimbatore	82%	68%	14
<u>Excess Cooking cost utilization</u>				
1	Pudukottai	94%	111%	16
2	Cuddalore	34%	49%	14

4.4.6 Reconciliation of utilization of food grains vis-à-vis no. of meals served:

The foodgrains utilisation during 2008-09 as against the no. of meals served shows wide variations in the following districts:-

Total No. of Districts = 31 (Refer Table 3.3 of the Analysis Sheet).

No.	District	No. of Meals served	Expected consumption of food grains (MTs)	Actual Consumption of food grains (MTs)	Diff in percentage
1	Coimbatore	23034392	3402.26	2768.63	-19%
2	Dharmapuri	39259803	4821.05	3925.98	-19%
3	Ariyalur	12157440	1420.72	1169.53	-18%
4	Trichy	27564908	3321.85	2756.49	-17%
5	Kanniyakumari	16325535	1953.76	1632.58	-16%
6	Tiruvarur	15292080	1829.00	1529.21	-16%
7	Pudukottai	25988504	3107.98	2598.85	-16%
8	Nagapattinam	26800330	3200.58	2680.04	-16%
9	Tirunelveli	27945840	3325.64	2794.58	-16%
10	The Nilgiris	7482470	889.79	748.25	-16%
11	Madurai	28811384	3421.28	2881.14	-16%
12	Karur	9482508	1123.99	947.20	-16%

4.4.7 A sum of **Rs. 510.21 lakhs** was released during 2008-09 (including unspent balance as on 31.3.08) as Central Assistance towards MME. Against this, the State has shown utilisation of Rs. 127.54 lakh (25%).

4.4.8 A sum of **Rs. 99.45 lakhs** was released during 2008-09 (including unspent balance as on 31.3.08) as Central Assistance towards Transport Assistance. Against this, the State has shown utilisation of Rs. 557.40 lakh (56%).

4.4.9 Out of **Rs. 31.77 Crore** of Central assistance released towards construction of 5295 kitchen sheds during 2006-07 to 2008-09 for primary and upper primary stage, the State reported **only 30% progress as on 31.12.2008.**

4.4.10 Out of **Rs. 15.83 crore** of Central assistance released towards procurement of kitchen devices for 31670 schools during 2006-07 to 2008-09 for primary and upper primary stage, the State reported 73% physical and financial progress.

4.4.11 State Govt. was requested to critically review the position in the light of above analysis/observations and to take corrective steps immediately wherever large scale discrepancies exist. These aspects should be critically monitored on quarterly basis by the supervisory officers at the District and State level. State Govt. was also requested to send an Action Taken Report to the Govt. of India at the earliest.

State representative undertook to look into the matter and assured that necessary remedial actions will be taken under intimation of Govt. of India.

4.5 MDM-PAB approvals: After discussion, the number of children (both for Primary and Upper-primary) and number of school days was approved by the Board for quantifying the Central assistance for **Tamil Nadu** for Mid Day meal for the year 2008-09 at the existing norms as per details given below:-

No	Details	As per State Plan		Approval by MDM-PAB
		No. of Schools (Table No.3/3-A)	No. of Children (Table No.16/16-A)	
1.	No. of Children to avail MDM			
Primary				
1.1	Govt. + Govt. aided + LB schools	28,766	31,56,857	31,56,857
1.2	EGS	92	3,214	3,214
1.3	AIE	154	1,425	1,425
TOTAL (A)		29,012	31,61,496	31,61,496
Upper Primary				
1.4	Govt. + Govt. aided + LB schools	18,148	18,60,534	18,60,534
1.5	EGS	0	0	0
1.6	AIE	0	0	0
TOTAL (B)		18,148	18,60,534	18,60,534
GRAND TOTAL (A) +(B)		65,308	50,22,030	50,22,030
2. No. of Working days				
2.1	Primary		220	217
2.2	Upper Primary		207	207

4.6 The above quantification is only an estimate for release of Central Assistance during 2009-10 under MDM Scheme. This scheme clearly provides that every student attending the Institutions, eligible to be covered under the Scheme will be served mid day meal on all school days. Therefore, the State will provide meal to all such students irrespective of the approved numbers of students and working days. In the event of State govt. finding on the basis of (i) MDM Attendance Registers maintained at School level and (ii) QPRs that the average number of children availing mid day meal (actual) and the working days are going to be more than the above approved figures, it may approach the GOI with evidence for enhancement of Central Assistance immediately after the end of first quarter (i.e. 30.6.2009). D/o School Education & Literacy with the approval of the Secretary will take a decision in this regard and put up the matter for post facto approval to be MDM PAB.

The working of Central Assistance for the State of Tamilnadu for 2009-10 based on the above mentioned number of children and no. of working days as approved by the MDM-PAB is enclosed herewith as **Annexure-3**.

The meeting ended with a word of thanks to the Chair.

--oOo--

(Sher Singh)
Under Secretary to the Government of India
Tele: 011-
Fax No. 011-